



A CIPP Model Evaluation of Functional Training for Civil Service Human Resource Analysts at PPSDM BKN

**Nia Pertiwi^{*1}, Ika Ardhile Nugrahaningtyas², Azis Untung Priyambudi³,
Robith Hasbi Saviar⁴**

Faculty of Administrative Sciences, University of Indonesia, Jakarta, Indonesia

^{*)} Corresponding Author
nia.pertiwi@ui.ac.id

Received : May 4, 2026; Accepted : August 18, 2026

DOI 10.25299/jiap.2026.28069

Abstract

This research evaluates the Functional Training Program for Civil Service Human Resource Analysts at the Human Resource Development Center of the National Civil Service Agency (PPSDM BKN) using the CIPP (Context, Input, Process, Product) evaluation model following the implementation of Ministerial Regulation No. 1 of 2023. This deregulation policy eliminated functional training as a mandatory requirement for appointment, resulting in an 18.13% decline in participant numbers during the 2022-2025 period. The study employed a qualitative approach through in-depth interviews with eight key informants spanning managerial, facilitator, and practising-analyst perspectives. Context evaluation findings indicate a paradigm shift in training from an administrative obligation to an optional competency development instrument. From the input perspective, the programme is supported by competent civil service trainers and an adaptive curriculum; however, budgetary limitations within user agencies remain the primary barrier to training accessibility. In terms of process, the main challenge is low participant focus retention in online training due to ongoing workloads throughout the training period. From the product perspective, the training has proven effective in enhancing the professionalism of functional officials, particularly those appointed through the position equalisation pathway, although post-training strategies at home agencies remain suboptimal. This study recommends accelerating the finalisation of PPSDM BKN's expanded function as a certification body for civil service management training, as well as curriculum innovation grounded in real-world case studies to sustain programme relevance amid the ongoing dynamics of bureaucratic reform.

Key Words : program evaluation, CIPP model, Civil Service Human Resource Analyst, PPSDM BKN, human resource development.

Introduction

The competency development of the Civil Service (ASN) constitutes a strategic pillar in fostering a professional and adaptive bureaucracy. Historically, functional training has played a pivotal role as a competency standardization mechanism for functional officials prior to assuming their duties. However, a fundamental transformation occurred with the enactment of the Minister of State Apparatus Utilisation and Bureaucratic Reform Regulation No. 1 of 2023 on Functional Positions. This regulation reformed the appointment mechanisms for Functional Positions (JF) covering first-time appointments, position transfers, adjustments, and promotions by eliminating functional training as a mandatory prerequisite for appointment. This deregulation policy triggers a theoretical contradiction: on one hand, Werner & DeSimone (2012) emphasize that organizations are increasingly dependent on technically skilled and professional employees; on the other hand, this policy correlates directly with a declining trend in the implementation of Functional Training for Civil Service HR Analysts at the Human Resource Development Center (PPSDM) of the National Civil Service Agency (BKN).

According to data from the Directorate of Civil Service Positions (2020), several functional positions fall under BKN's oversight, including Civil Service HR Analysts, Assessors, Pranatants, and Civil Service Management Auditors. Nevertheless, this research specifically focuses on the Functional Training of Civil Service HR Analysts, as this position recorded the highest volume of training sessions at PPPSDM BKN between 2022 and 2025, consistently averaging 7 to 8 cohorts per year. This makes it the most adequate representation for examining the dynamics following regulatory disruption. Implementation data for the 2022–2026 period, however, reveals a significant downward trend, as presented in Table 1.

**Table 1. Summary of Civil Service HR Analyst Functional Training Delivery
at PPPSDM BKN, 2022-2026**

No	Year	Number of Batches	Total Participants
1.	2022	8	331
2.	2023	7	287
3.	2024	8	281
4.	2025	7	271
5.	2026 (until April)	1	38

Source: PPPSDM BKN data as of April 2026, processed by the authors.

Based on Table 1, the number of participants for the Civil Service HR Analyst functional training decreased from 331 in 2022 to 271 in 2025, representing an overall decline of 18.13%. As the 2026 figure covers only the period up to April, it is not directly comparable with full-year data and is therefore not included in the calculation of this decline. This downward pattern must be understood within the broader context of ASN policy. In 2020, the government suspended Civil Servant (CPNS) selection due to the COVID-19 pandemic, followed by large-scale recruitment in 2021. This wave of appointments is estimated to have contributed to the high number of participants in 2022. Following the issuance of Ministerial Regulation No. 1 of 2023,

participant numbers have consistently declined. This pattern suggests that the decline is not merely a post-pandemic cyclical fluctuation, although enrollment figures alone cannot establish a direct causal link between the regulation and the decline in participation. As elaborated in the Context Evaluation section below, informants attribute the decline to a combination of factors, including the regulatory shift itself, agency-level budget efficiency measures introduced since 2025, and the growing availability of alternative, non-training pathways to appointment. The decline is therefore best understood as coinciding with, rather than being solely caused by, the regulatory disruption that shifts functional training from a prerequisite for appointment to an instrument for continuous post-appointment competency development. Consequently, competency tests have been established as the primary instrument for determining eligibility for transfers and promotions without the requirement for prior functional training.

The ease of appointment without training prerequisites has fostered a perception that technical competence can be acquired autodidactically in the workplace, thereby reducing the perceived urgency of participating in structured formal training programs. However, Chaudhury et al. (2022) warn that the most acute challenge in informal learning models lies in the difficulty of objectively measuring progress and evaluating learning outcomes. Therefore, aligned with the perspective of Nimkoompai et al. (2024), while self-directed learning offers flexibility, the presence of structured educational approaches remains absolute to ensure competency standardization.

Program evaluation within the public sector has garnered significant scholarly attention, employing a diverse array of evaluative frameworks. Aulia (2021) evaluated technical training for public services using the CIPP model and observed that while overall implementation was successful, product evaluation tended to remain purely administrative, lacking robust monitoring of long-term performance impacts. In a comparative analysis conducted in South Korea, Lim & Lee (2015) demonstrated that context evaluation is highly effective in reflecting labor market shifts; however, it often exhibits low responsiveness to the individual needs of participants. Furthermore, Shofiyani & Salomo (2025), in their study of the Fresh Graduate Academy (FGA) program, identified critical bottlenecks within the input dimension, specifically a disproportionate ratio of organizing committees to training workloads and noted a lack of interactivity within the process dimension.

Sari (2021), investigating Level IV Leadership Training in Lahat Regency, found that success in process and product dimensions is not always underpinned by robust context and input factors, particularly regarding administrative irregularities and non-selective participant recruitment. Additionally, Zahroh et al. (2025) cited the work of Prasetyono et al. (2019) on batik skills training, highlighting that deficiencies in facilities and instructor qualifications (input) directly correlated with the low percentage of graduates capable of establishing independent businesses (product). Generally, these studies position CIPP components as independent variables influencing program effectiveness or employee professionalism as the dependent variable. This current research seeks to address a prevalent limitation in prior studies: the over-reliance on self-reported questionnaires, which are susceptible to bias. Consequently, this study employs a triangulation approach, integrating in-depth interviews with comprehensive literature reviews and organizational document analysis to enhance empirical rigor.

Conceptually, this phenomenon poses a challenge within the Human Resource Development (HRD) framework. HRD is defined as a series of systematic, planned activities through which organizations help members learn the skills needed to meet current and future job demands, with the goal of improving performance at the individual, process, and organizational levels (Swanson, 2021; Werner & DeSimone, 2012). Without formal training, standardizing Civil Service HR Analyst competencies across agencies becomes difficult, raising the risk of a widening performance gap, the distance between actual and desired performance, and of an undetected decline in training transfer, since HRD theory suggests that only a small fraction of development investment typically translates into workplace performance (Swanson, 2021; Werner & DeSimone, 2012).

To evaluate this phenomenon, this study employs the CIPP Evaluation Model developed by Stufflebeam, a systematic process for describing, obtaining, reporting, and applying information about a programme's value to guide decision-making and enhance accountability (Stufflebeam & Zhang, 2017). Unlike the Kirkpatrick model, which focuses primarily on post-programme outcomes, CIPP treats a programme as a dynamic system encompassing its environment, planning, and implementation, consistent with the HRD principle that evaluation exists not to prove but to improve (Aulia, 2021; Idrus et al., 2025; Stufflebeam & Zhang, 2017). The model comprises four dimensions: (1) Context Evaluation, assessing needs and the impact of Ministerial Regulation No. 1 of 2023 on programme goals; (2) Input Evaluation, assessing programme strategies, budgets, and resource adequacy; (3) Process Evaluation, monitoring implementation for procedural defects and obstacles; and (4) Product Evaluation, measuring outcomes in terms of impact, effectiveness, sustainability, and transportability. This framework suits uncontrolled, real-world conditions such as sudden bureaucratic policy change, and using HRD as the overarching theory integrated with CIPP provides a foundation for PPSDM BKN to reorient its training strategy.

In practice, evaluations of the training program have been conducted, including participant reaction assessments, pre-tests, post-tests, and monitoring of post-training behavioral impacts within the participants' respective agencies. However, current evaluations focus primarily on end-results and fail to address more fundamental aspects such as program suitability, input readiness, or overall process effectiveness. Discussions regarding the future direction of the program have been limited to internal meetings, lacking support from comprehensive and systematic evaluative studies. Thus, a program evaluation using the CIPP model is deemed relevant to provide a holistic overview and recommendations that can serve as a basis for the future development of the Civil Service HR Analyst training program.

The novelty of this research lies in its evaluative focus: rather than simply assessing an ongoing programme's success, it evaluates the reorientation of training strategy amid a national regulatory disruption that shifted functional training from a prerequisite for appointment to a continuous post-appointment development instrument, a shift not yet extensively discussed in the literature on training evaluation within supervisory agencies such as BKN. While prior studies have applied the CIPP model to general technical or digital training, this research examines how a supervisory body responds to declining training interest through Context evaluation, to redefine needs, and Product evaluation, to assess the programme's future sustainability. In doing so, this study aims to fill the gap regarding how government training institutions adapt to maintain ASN professionalism standards once formal training is no longer the sole entry point into functional positions, moving beyond an end-result assessment by also examining input adequacy and process effectiveness in an integrated manner.

Addressing this gap, this study aims to evaluate the Civil Service HR Analyst Functional Training Program through the CIPP evaluation framework and to analyse the strategic measures required for BKN to develop the programme in response to post-regulatory disruption.

Method

Research Design

This study adopts a post-positivist paradigm employing a qualitative methodological approach. Creswell and Poth (2018) define qualitative research as an inquiry process directed toward understanding the meanings that individuals or groups ascribe to social or human problems, conducted through data gathered in natural settings. The post-positivist orientation is appropriate here because, while the study acknowledges objective realities such as declining enrolment statistics, it recognises that the causes and implications of these realities are fundamentally shaped by the subjective interpretations of the actors involved: programme administrators, facilitators, and participants.

The qualitative approach was selected over quantitative alternatives for several methodological reasons. First, the research questions demand an understanding of complex processes and institutional dynamics that cannot be adequately captured through numerical data alone. Second, the post-regulatory disruption context makes it important to understand the lived experiences and strategic reasoning of practitioners, which requires the depth and contextual sensitivity that qualitative methods provide. Third, the relatively small population of key stakeholders directly involved in the design, delivery, and receipt of the PPSDM BKN training programme makes in-depth interviewing a more appropriate data collection strategy than survey-based approaches.

Sampling and Informants

Informants were selected through purposive sampling, a non-probability sampling strategy in which participants are chosen on the basis of their relevance and capacity to provide information-rich accounts pertaining to the research questions (Bryman, 2012). This strategy ensures that each informant selected can contribute a distinctive and substantively valuable perspective on the research phenomenon.

Eight informants were selected across three categories to ensure comprehensive coverage of the relevant stakeholder perspectives: one management informant overseeing ASN Management functional training within PPSDM BKN, one senior Widyaiswara holding a training-coordination role, and six practising Civil Service HR Analyst officials. The first category comprised the management informant, providing institutional perspectives on programme objectives, resource planning, and strategic direction within PPSDM BKN's ASN Management Functional Training Division. The second category comprised the senior Widyaiswara informant, offering insights into curriculum design, instructional quality, and the dynamics of training delivery. The third category comprised six practising Civil Service HR Analyst officials, three of whom had completed the functional training programme and three of whom had been appointed through alternative routes, such as position equalization, without attending the programme, enabling a comparative assessment of training outcomes from the recipient's perspective. Informant identities are preserved through anonymisation in accordance with research ethics protocols.

Data Collection and Analysis

The primary data collection technique was the semi-structured interview, conducted online via Zoom Meeting. Each interview session was guided by a structured interview protocol aligned with the four CIPP dimensions, while allowing the researcher sufficient flexibility to pursue emergent themes of analytical relevance (Bryman, 2012). Interview sessions ranged from approximately 45 to 75 minutes in duration and were recorded with informant consent. Verbatim transcripts were produced for all sessions and subject to member-checking to verify accuracy and confirm interpretive fidelity.

Data analysis proceeded through a thematic analysis approach. Transcripts were subjected to iterative open coding, in which recurring themes, patterns, and conceptual categories were identified across informant responses. Codes were subsequently organised into axial categories aligned with the four CIPP dimensions, before selective coding was applied to synthesise overarching interpretive themes. This analytical process was conducted in parallel with secondary data analysis, which included a review of relevant regulations, institutional programme statistics, and academic literature pertaining to functional training evaluation in the Indonesian public sector.

Trustworthiness was established through multiple strategies. Credibility was enhanced through triangulation of data sources (interview data, institutional documents, and regulatory texts) and prolonged engagement with research materials. Transferability was supported through the provision of thick descriptive accounts of the research context. Dependability was addressed through an audit trail documenting key analytical decisions. Confirmability was promoted through reflective documentation of the researchers' positionality, given that several members of the research team are themselves practitioners within the ASN management domain.

Results and Discussion

The evaluation of the Civil Service HR Analyst Functional Training Program at PPSDM BKN was conducted across the four dimensions of the CIPP model, synthesising primary data from eight in-depth interviews with key informants and secondary data comprising relevant regulations, literature, and institutional statistical reports.

To make the evaluation criteria explicit, Table 2 summarises each CIPP dimension alongside its indicators, data sources, key findings, and the evaluative judgment drawn from them. The judgments below synthesise informants' accounts and institutional documentation gathered in this study; they are not independently verified against externally set performance standards, and are reported as the qualitative judgment of the evaluation team.

Table 2. CIPP Evaluation Matrix: Dimensions, Indicators, Data Sources, Key Findings, and Evaluative Judgments

Dimensions	Indicators	Data Sources	Key Findings	Evaluative Judgments
Context	Alignment of programme objectives with regulatory change and user-agency needs	Interview with management informant; Ministerial Regulation No. 1 of 2023; participant statistics 2022–2025	Programme function shifted from mandatory prerequisite to optional competency instrument; participation declined 18.13% (2022–2025)	Relevant in substance, but requires more proactive engagement with user agencies to sustain demand
Input	Facilitator competence, curriculum adequacy, budget availability	Interviews with management and senior Widyaiswara informants; curriculum documentation	Facilitators competent and curriculum adaptive, but facilitator–participant grade mismatch and budget constraints in user agencies limit accessibility	Adequate in substance, weak in accessibility
Process	Participant engagement, delivery-modality effectiveness, assignment management	Interviews with HR Analyst informants; training delivery records	Hybrid delivery is cost-efficient, but participant focus is undermined by concurrent office workload and rigid submission deadlines; seniority dynamics constrain face-to-face engagement	Efficient, but weak in sustaining learning focus
Product	Perceived individual competency gain, organisational transfer, institutional sustainability	Interviews with HR Analyst and management informants; institutional documentation on the certification-body initiative	Perceived improvement in individual professionalism; limited organisational transfer due to absence of post-training mechanisms; certification-body initiative underway since 2024 but not yet finalised	Effective at individual level; limited at organisational level; promising but unfinalised at institutional level

Source: synthesised by the authors from primary and secondary data collected in this study.

Context Evaluation

Context evaluation examines whether programme objectives remain aligned with organisational needs and regulatory shifts. The findings reveal a significant paradigm shift following the implementation of Ministerial Regulation No. 1 of 2023. Management informants indicated that while the substantive goal of standardising competency to mitigate performance gaps remains intact, the programme's function has transitioned from a "mandatory prerequisite for appointment" to an "optional competency development instrument." Training now serves primarily as a foundational reinforcement for incumbents, particularly those appointed through position equalisation or lateral transfers.

Informants serving as practising HR Analysts emphasised that dynamic governance transformations require continuously updated technical proficiency that formal training is uniquely positioned to provide. Without standardised instruction, there is a risk of fragmented policy interpretation across central and regional agencies, potentially compromising nationwide HR management consistency. This observation is consistent with Lim and Lee's (2015) finding that context evaluation must account not only for macro-level policy shifts but also for the granular, agency-specific learning needs of participants.

The decline in participation from 331 in 2022 to 271 in 2025 reflects more than a statistical trend, it represents the loss of regulatory driven demand. Management informants were careful to note, however, that the regulation is not the sole driver of this trend: the unusually large 2021 recruitment cohort inflated the 2022 baseline, and agency-level budget efficiency measures introduced since 2025 have independently reduced the number of participants agencies are able to send, irrespective of the regulatory change. PPSDM BKN must now transition from operating as a passive regulator to positioning itself as a proactive strategic partner, directly engaging user agencies to sustain enrollment. This challenge is compounded by the tendency of agencies to prioritise operational expenditure over competency development allocations during periods of fiscal austerity, echoing Aulia's (2021) observation that organisational support for training participation is a frequently underweighted determinant of programme effectiveness.

Input Evaluation

Input evaluation assesses the adequacy of human resources, curriculum, and financial resources in supporting programme delivery. PPSDM BKN is supported by highly competent civil service trainers with demonstrable expertise in ASN management. Where thematic gaps exist, technical unit practitioners are engaged as supplementary resource persons. However, Senior Expert participants reported a perceived ceiling in instructional depth when facilitators were drawn from lower grade levels, particularly for topics requiring advanced analytical engagement such as strategic workforce planning and organisational design. Consistent with Shofiyani and Salomo's (2025) findings on facilitator calibration, facilitator assignments should be proportional to the professional seniority of the participant cohort.

The curriculum is updated regularly and offers a competitive advantage through its flexibility to accommodate agency-specific institutional needs. Nevertheless, participants consistently called for a greater emphasis on organisational design, bureaucratic reform, and modern talent management, as well as a rebalancing of the pedagogical approach away from theoretical exposition toward real-world problem-solving case studies an orientation aligned with HRD best practices for adult professional learners (Werner & Desimone, 2012). Budgetary constraints represent the most structurally significant input barrier: fiscal efficiency directives at the agency level have resulted in the systematic reduction of training allocations for HR Analysts in favour of core technical functional positions, creating a structural disincentive that may perpetuate the very competency gaps the programme is designed to address (Chalofsky et al., 2014).

Process Evaluation

Process evaluation monitors programme execution to identify implementation bottlenecks. The hybrid delivery modality combines synchronous instruction via Zoom Meeting with asynchronous self-directed learning through BKN Pedia that offers meaningful cost and logistics advantages, but presents significant challenges in sustaining participant focus. The majority of online participants remain burdened with routine office duties during training hours, effectively splitting their cognitive attention between learning activities and operational demands. This directly undermines what Werner and Desimone (2012) term readiness to learn: without institutional arrangements that protect training time from work interruptions, the structural conditions for effective online learning cannot be maintained.

Related to this is the management of assignment deadlines. Unlike residential training, which affords participants full cognitive immersion, online participants must complete assignments within the compressed margins of an active working day. Informants reported excessive pressure from strict submission deadlines amidst routine workloads, compromising both the quality of outputs and the depth of reflective engagement with learning material. In face-to-face settings, a distinct challenge arises from seniority dynamics within cohorts: when participants outrank facilitators in position or seniority, a psychological barrier may emerge that constrains assertive instructional management and limits critical analytical discussion, resulting in a less conducive learning environment.

Product Evaluation

The findings indicate that participation is perceived to produce improvements in individual professionalism, particularly for officials transitioning from structural to functional roles without prior technical backgrounds in HR management. Alumni reported a perceived improvement in workflow structure, regulatory comprehension, and confidence in navigating complex administrative decisions, outcomes that self-directed workplace learning had not systematically replicated. As these accounts rely on informants' retrospective perceptions rather than pre- and post-training assessments, supervisor evaluations, or performance records, the findings should be read as perceived improvements at the individual level rather than measured evidence of organisational performance impact. These findings are consistent with Sari (2021) and Aulia (2021), who similarly found that CIPP-evaluated public sector training programmes demonstrate positive product outcomes at the individual competency level.

While all informants agreed that the programme is essential for maintaining professional standards, its organisational impact appears constrained based on informants' accounts. Knowledge acquired during training tends to remain at the individual level upon alumni returning to their home agencies, a pattern tentatively associated with the absence of structured post-training mechanisms such as mandatory knowledge-sharing sessions or mentoring arrangements within work units. Post-training responsibility is divided between PPSDM BKN, which provides training materials and follow-up guidelines, and participants' home agencies, which are responsible for providing opportunities for application and supervision in the workplace. Further evidence from alumni supervisors or post-training monitoring documents would strengthen this interpretation. This reflects the broader HRD transfer of training problem identified by Werner and DeSimone (2012): transfer from the individual to the organisational level requires deliberate structural enablers, including supervisory support, practice opportunities, and feedback mechanisms, none of which are currently mandated by PPSDM BKN or user agencies in the post-training period.

The most strategically significant product finding concerns PPSDM BKN's initiative, commenced in 2024, to develop its capacity as a certification body for government training providers. This represents a qualitative shift from centralised delivery to a national standard-setting role, aligning with the transportability sub-dimension of CIPP product evaluation (Stufflebeam & Zhang, 2017). Realising this role will require a clear legal basis, an implementation mechanism, institutional readiness, and a quality-assurance scheme, and it should therefore not yet be positioned as a stand-alone strategic solution pending further assessment of these aspects. By empowering user agencies to conduct independent civil service management training based on BKN-prescribed standards, this initiative directly

addresses the accessibility barriers and budget constraints identified across the context and input dimensions of this evaluation.

Programme Development Strategies

Drawing from the integrated findings of the four CIPP dimensions, six strategic measures are recommended. The BKN Pedia platform should be optimised as a dedicated medium for asynchronous delivery of foundational knowledge, enabling synchronous and face-to-face sessions to focus exclusively on high-level analytical case study discussions. Simultaneously, a structured alumni Community of Practice should be established to ensure that knowledge transfer extends beyond individual training completion, delivering tangible impact at the work unit level and addressing the sustainability deficit identified in the product evaluation. Curriculum reorientation should integrate contemporary competency demands including modern talent management, digital governance, and bureaucratic reform particularly for senior experts participants, with biennial review cycles informed by alumni and agency consultations.

At the operational level, assignments should be calibrated to participant grade level, engaging Senior Expert cohorts with analytically complex tasks proportional to their professional responsibilities. Online submission protocols should be redesigned with flexibility mechanisms, phased windows or formal agency agreements protecting training time to accommodate participants' dual workload realities. Finally, and most urgently, the finalisation of PPSDM BKN's expanded certification function must be treated as an institutional priority. This single measure has the potential to simultaneously resolve the accessibility barrier, the scalability constraint, and the competency consistency challenge, by enabling decentralised delivery of standardised ASN management training at national scale without exclusive reliance on centralised provision.

Conclusion

This study has conducted a comprehensive CIPP evaluation of the Civil Service HR Analyst Functional Training Program delivered by PPSDM BKN in the aftermath of a significant regulatory disruption. The findings collectively affirm the programme's enduring value while illuminating the structural challenges that constrain its reach and impact.

Context evaluation establishes that Ministerial Regulation No. 1 of 2023 has repositioned functional training from a mandatory requirement to an optional instrument, producing a consistent enrolment decline compounded by agency-level budget efficiency pressures. Paradoxically, the theoretical urgency of formal training has intensified: as appointment pathways diversify, the risk of widening competency gaps among officials entering the Analyst position without prior formal preparation escalates. Input evaluation confirms that PPSDM BKN possesses strong facilitator expertise and an adaptive curriculum, though facilitator-participant grade misalignment and budget accessibility constraints partially offset these strengths.

Process evaluation identifies the dual workload burden of online training as the most operationally significant impediment to learning quality, compounded by seniority dynamics in face-to-face settings that constrain critical instructional engagement. Product evaluation demonstrates that training participation produces measurable improvements in individual professionalism and workflow precision, particularly for officials appointed through position-

equalization pathways; however, the absence of structured post-training mechanisms limits the transfer of these gains to the organisational level.

Theoretical and Practical Implications

Theoretically, this study offers an empirical illustration of how HRD performance gap theory can be applied alongside the CIPP model's multi-dimensional evaluative framework within the specific context of ASN training following regulatory disruption, rather than proposing a new theoretical contribution. It also illustrates the value of qualitative triangulation in mitigating, though not fully resolving, the self-report bias that remains prevalent in prior CIPP evaluations, particularly given that product findings in this study continue to rely substantially on participants' perceptions.

Practically, the findings underscore the urgency of accelerating PPSDM BKN's transition into a certification body for government training providers, which would simultaneously address accessibility, scalability, and competency consistency at national scale. User agencies must complement this by instituting learning-protected time policies and post-training knowledge-sharing mandates to ensure that individual competency gains translate into organisational capability.

Limitations and Future Research

This study is limited by its focus on a single supervisory agency and its reliance on interview-based data from a relatively small informant pool, which constrains the generalisability of findings to other functional training contexts. In particular, while this study already includes practising HR Analysts appointed without attending the functional training programme, it did not include user-agency officials responsible for training budgets or direct supervisors of training alumni; their perspectives would strengthen future assessments of training accessibility, organisational support, and the transfer of learning to the workplace. Future research should pursue a Return on Investment analysis to quantify the financial and productivity benefits of functional training, longitudinal tracking of alumni performance to assess long-term transfer of training outcomes, and comparative studies across other ASN management functional positions supervised by BKN to broaden the empirical base for evaluative conclusions.

Acknowledgement

The authors express their sincere gratitude to the management and staff of PPSDM BKN, the civil service trainers, and all informants who generously dedicated their time and contributed substantive insights that made this research possible. This study was conducted as part of the Human Resource Development Theory and Practice course within the Master of Administrative Science Programme at the Faculty of Administrative Science, Universitas Indonesia.

References

- Ali, S., Tufail, M., & Qazi Rashida. (2022). Training evaluation models: Comparative analysis. *Research Journal of Social Sciences & Economics Review*, 3, 51–63.
- Aulia, R. (2021). Evaluasi pelatihan teknis pelayanan publik Balai Diklat Keagamaan Jakarta dengan model CIPP. *Jurnal Kediklatan Balai Diklat Keagamaan Jakarta*, 2, 158–173.

- Bryman, A. (2012). *Social research methods* (4th ed.). Oxford University Press.
- Chalofky, N. E., Rocco, T. S., & Morris, M. L. (Eds.). (2014). *Handbook of human resources development*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- Chaudhury, R., Guo, P. J., & Chilana, P. K. (2022). "There's no way to keep up!": Diverse motivations and challenges faced by informal learners of ML. *2022 IEEE Symposium on Visual Languages and Human-Centric Computing (VL/HCC)*, 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.1109/VL/HCC53370.2022.9833100>
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry & research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). Sage Publications, Inc.
- Direktorat Jabatan Aparatur Sipil Negara (2020). Profil Jabatan Fungsional 2020. Juni 2020. <https://www.bkn.go.id/storage/2022/09/Profil-Jabatan-Fungsional-2020.pdf>
- Idrus, A., Setiyadi, B., Syarif, M. I., Wahyu, A., & Suharto. (2025). Evaluation of education program implementation at Pusat Kegiatan Belajar Masyarakat (PKBM), Jambi City. *Evaluation and Program Planning*, 111, 102535. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.evalprogplan.2025.102535>
- Lim, S.-M., & Lee, Y.-M. (2015). Comparative analysis of training programs for outplacement service workers in Korea: Focused on the CIPP evaluation model. *Review of Integrative Business and Economics Research*, 14.
- Nimkoompai, A., Chotirat, S., & Nuchitprasitchai, S. (2024). Student-centered learning in HCI/UX/UI framework: The Thai experience. *2024 8th International Conference on Information Technology (InCIT)*, 121–126. <https://doi.org/10.1109/InCIT63192.2024.10810571>
- Sari, D. N. F. (2021). Evaluasi program pendidikan dan pelatihan kepemimpinan tingkat IV dalam kebijakan pengembangan kompetensi ASN di Pemerintah Kabupaten Lahat [Evaluation of Leadership Training Level IV in ASN competency development policy]. *Jurnal Caraka Prabu*, 5, 163–186.
- Shofiyani, A., & Salomo, R. V. (2025). Evaluasi program pengembangan talenta digital: Fresh Graduate Academy (FGA) [Evaluation of the FGA digital talent development programme]. *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan dan Ilmu Sosial*, 6(3), 1817–1830.
- Stufflebeam, D. L., & Zhang, G. (2017). *The CIPP evaluation model: How to evaluate for improvement and accountability*. The Guilford Press.
- Swanson, R. A. (2021). *Foundations of human resources development* (3rd ed.). Berrett-Koehler Publishers, Inc.
- Werner, J. M., & Desimone, R. L. (2012). *Human resource development* (6th ed.). South-Western.
- Zahroh, M., Susarno, L. H., & Bachri, S. B. (2025). The CIPP model in training program evaluation: How effective is it? *Journal of Educational Technology Studies and Applied Research*, 1.